

**NEW YORK METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COUNCIL
SEPTEMBER 24, 2009 MEETING SYNOPSIS**

A. CALL TO ORDER AND INTRODUCTIONS

The meeting was called to order by Mr. Robert Zerrillo of the New York State Department of Transportation (NYSDOT) and Secretary of the New York Metropolitan Transportation Council. The members of the Council introduced themselves. It was declared that there was a quorum. Acting Commissioner Stan Gee of New York State Department of Transportation chaired the meeting.

B. OPENING SESSION

NYMTC's Permanent Co-Chair, Acting Commissioner Stan Gee

Acting Commissioner Stan Gee welcomed all attendees. He said that it was an honor to have the United States Secretary of Transportation, Ray LaHood, join the meeting and was delighted that the Secretary agreed to be the keynote speaker. Acting Commissioner Gee said that the Council would formally adopt the 2010-2035 Regional Transportation Plan which incorporated NYMTC's vision, "A Shared Vision for a Shared Future". He said the Regional Transportation Plan would include projects and programs that would support sustainable growth through strategic regional transportation investments during the next 25 years.

NYMTC Co-Chair, Director Amanda Burden, New York City Department of City Planning

Director Amanda Burden of the New York City Department of City Planning and co-chair to the Council said it was timely that Secretary LaHood was available to discuss the Obama Administration's Sustainable Communities initiative. Ms. Burden said that New York City had been in the forefront of building sustainable communities. She said that the metropolitan area needed to be reviewed holistically and formulate plans where transportation, development, and environmental policy were all integrated. She said that one-fifth of the city had been rezoned by focusing on denser, more mixed-use development, creating new amenities for communities and building walkable, bikeable neighborhoods. She said mass transit use had increased and that automobile usage stayed flat. Ms. Burden said that the primary focus of NYMTC's shared vision was to devote planning to long-term sustainability through solutions that integrate transportation and land-use, provide the amenities that made communities desirable places to live and work, and thus decrease carbon emissions by developing compact neighborhoods and creating mixed-use, inclusive neighborhoods. She said that the metropolitan area had embraced the smart growth livability principles by developing and promoting transportation options, protecting and creating affordable housing, and creating new mixed-use downtowns. Ms. Burden said to grow in a sustainable manner, the comprehensive transit network had to be expanded and upgraded; and obtaining funding to support and deliver the shared vision for sustainable growth was necessary. She said she looked forward to working towards holistic solutions with Washington and New York City becoming the model for smart growth for the country.

NYMTC Executive Director's Report

Executive Director Joel Ettinger of NYMTC announced that the Council would act on NYMTC's long-range Regional Transportation Plan which included the Council's vision for sustainable regional growth. He said that NYMTC had played a key role in evaluating and selecting candidate projects for funding through the American Recovery and Reinvestment Act of 2009. He said that NYMTC had taken actions to amend or modify the Regional Transportation Plan and the Transportation Improvement Program so that more than 120 candidate projects totaling nearly two billion dollars could be readied for certification and ultimate obligation of Recovery Act funding by the Federal government. He reported that 13 projects for over \$11 million in Job Access/Reverse Commute and New Freedom funding were reviewed and recommended for funding. He announced that the Coordinated Public Transit-Human Services Transportation Plan had been adopted. He

talked about the U.S. Department of Transportation's TIGER Grant Program and reported that about 35 projects proposals for possible TIGER grants were collected. He reported that development of the 2010-2011 Unified Planning Work Program had begun. Mr. Ettinger said that a memorandum of understanding with four neighboring Metropolitan Planning Organizations in the tri-state area was signed. This would better integrate and coordinate planning activities regionally. He reported that a Bus Rapid Transit conference was in the planning stages for the fall.

C. KEYNOTE SPEAKER: Secretary of Transportation Ray LaHood

Secretary Ray LaHood of the United States Department of Transportation talked about the importance of ratifying a 25 year regional transportation plan for the region. Secretary LaHood said that the economic future of the nation and its quality of life would depend on the ability to achieve greater energy independence, reduce energy costs and grow communities in ways that were truly sustainable. Secretary LaHood said that as the nation's most densely populated, transit-intensive region in the country, New York would, by design and by necessity, point the way forward. He said that New York was not afraid to experiment and to think outside the box, to envision a future that would enhance urban mobility without piling on more congestion, more pollution, and more sprawl—thus producing new bike paths and open spaces such as the pedestrian mall in Times Square. He said that NYMTC's 25 year plan emphasized the need to lower transportation costs, protect the environment, and develop land more rationally. The Secretary talked about the Obama Administration plans of working with Congress to pass comprehensive clean energy and climate legislation as well as pass a transformational surface transportation reauthorization bill that focused on reducing carbon emissions and reducing oil dependence. Secretary LaHood said an important challenge was reducing the energy required to move people and goods around the country while improving mobility, safety and efficiency. He said that Recovery Act funds were being made available for creative, intermodal projects of national significance that promoted livability and sustainability in the country. The Secretary said that the Obama Administration would work with Congress to streamline federal transportation programs, identify new sustainable funding sources, and provide greater flexibility to metropolitan regions. The full speech can be found at www.NYMTC.org

D. PRESENTATION OF THE REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PLAN

With the help of slides, Joel Ettinger provided a summary on the shared vision of the NYMTC members with a presentation of the 2010-2035 Regional Transportation Plan, "A Shared Vision for a Shared Future". Mr. Ettinger said that the 2010-2035 Regional Transportation Plan was built around the Council's shared vision that identified the five shared goals, ten desired growth areas and 28 strategic transportation investments. The full presentation can be found on the website at www.NYMTC.org.

E. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Philip A. Marino, Supervisor, Town of Stony Point, submitted a summary of traffic improvement needed for the Town of Stony Point that would reduce the amount of parking and provide fewer vehicular miles traveled in the redevelopment of the old Letchworth Village site. It was recommended that shuttle bus traffic be allowed on Palisades Interstate Parkway to the Patriot Center in order to use the Anthony Wayne parking area during baseball games and for a future park and ride facility. He reported that traffic improvement was needed on the rehabilitation of Palisades Interstate Parkway from exit 10 to the Bear Mountain Bridge; acceleration/deceleration lanes and shoulder improvement were needed along the parkway; and widening the Palisades Interstate Parkway northbound and southbound ramps with signals at each ramp was also needed.

James Raleigh, a resident of Monmouth County, New Jersey, submitted remarks regarding New Jersey Transit's Access to the Region's Core Project. He said more regional planning needed to be done and suggested that new tunnels connect the Penn Station/Farley Post Office with Grand Central Terminal and the East Side. (See remarks attached)

Roxanne Warren, chair of Vision 42, submitted remarks citing disappointment that light rail was left out of the 2010-2035 Regional Transportation Plan, "A Shared Vision for a Shared Future". She asked the Council to vote against the 2010-2035 Regional Transportation Plan. (See remarks attached)

Murray Bodin, Concerned Grandparents, said that the NYMTC needed to think outside of the box; various agencies lacked uniformity; and rail on the Tappan Zee Bridge was not necessary.

George Haikalis, Institute for Rational Urban Mobility, Inc., urged the Council to vote against the adoption of the 2010-2035 Regional Transportation Plan. He said there was a regional disconnect in the Plan. He noted his opposition to the building of New Jersey Transit's Access to the Region's Core (ARC) project and also requested the release of the ARC Major Investment Study to the public. In addition, he explained his opposition to the building of a deep cavern below Grand Central Terminal. (See remarks attached)

Thomas Madden from the Town of Greenburgh submitted the attached proposal of transportation improvement projects for consideration of federal funding as part of the amendments to the NYMTC 2008-2012 Transportation Improvement Program. (See attached)

Victor Carosi also from the Town of Greenburgh asked the Council to support their roadway and intersection improvements that would affect three municipalities—Town of Greenburgh, the Village of Ardsley and the Village of Hasting on Hudson. He said that their regional approach for traffic planning focused on the long term impact outside the municipal borders and therefore required greater cooperation within municipal borders. He asked the Council to consider their project in the future.

F. ACTION ITEMS

1. ACCEPT: MARCH 19, 2009 MEETING SYNOPSIS

Acting Commissioner Gee asked for a motion to accept the March 19, 2009 Council Meeting Synopsis. A motion was made by County Executive Andrew J. Spano of Westchester County, and seconded by Commissioner Janette Sadik-Khan of the New York City Department of Transportation. The meeting synopsis was accepted. There was no discussion.

2. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2009-3 – COUNCIL ADOPTION OF THE 2010-2035 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PLAN AND ASSOCIATED PRODUCT

Acting Commissioner Gee said that the Regional Transportation Plan sets the region's transportation agenda for the next 25 years, forecasts future trends, and provides a blueprint for long-range strategic transportation studies and investments.

A motion to adopt Resolution #2009-3, Council Adoption of the 2010-2035 Regional Transportation Plan and Associated Product was made by Mr. Robert Shinnick, representing County Executive Steve Levy of Suffolk County and seconded by Director Amanda Burden of the New York City Department of City Planning. The resolution unanimously passed. There was no discussion.

3. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2009-4 – COUNCIL ADOPTION OF A JOINT COOPERATIVE PLANNING AGREEMENT TO FULFILL FEDERAL PLANNING REQUIREMENTS

Gerry Bogacz reported that federal regulation required the metropolitan planning organization, the State and public transportation operators to cooperatively determine their mutual responsibilities to carry out the metropolitan transportation planning process and that these responsibilities be clearly identified in written agreement among the metropolitan planning organization, the State, and the public transportation operators serving a metropolitan planning area. He said an agreement was arranged and the Program, Finance, and

Administration Committee endorsed the Joint Cooperative Planning Agreement at its September 17, 2009 meeting.

A motion to adopt Resolution #2009-4, Council Adoption of a Joint Cooperative Planning Agreement to Fulfill Federal Planning Requirement was motioned by Director Amanda Burden of the New York City Department of City Planning, and seconded by John Tulley, Deputy County Executive representing County Executive Robert Bondi of Putnam County. The resolution unanimously passed.

4. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2009-5 – DISTRIBUTION OF FEDERAL FISCAL YEAR 2009 FEDERAL TRANSIT ADMINISTRATION’S SECTION 5307 (AND SECTION 530) CAPITAL FUNDS

Gerry Bogacz said that the Section 5307 (and Section 5340) Capital funds were apportioned by the Federal Transit Administration to the New York-Newark, New York-New Jersey-Connecticut urbanized area (UZA 1) and the Bridgeport-Stamford, Connecticut-New York urbanized area (UZA 41) each Federal fiscal year. He said it was the Council’s responsibility to distribute the apportioned funds to the member agencies.

A motion to adopt Resolution #2009-5, Distribution of Federal Fiscal Year 2009 Federal Transit Administration’s Section 5307 (And Section 5340) Capital Funds was motioned by County Executive Andrew J. Spano of Westchester County, and seconded by Commissioner Janet Sadik-Khan of the New York City Department of Transportation. The resolution unanimously passed.

G. ADJOURN

Acting Commissioner Gee motioned the meeting to be adjourned.

ATTENDANCE

Voting Council Principals/Representatives

Permanent Co-Chair & Acting Commissioner Stan Gee, NYS Dept of Transportation
Co-Chair & Director Amanda Burden, NYC Department of City Planning
County Executive Andrew J. Spano, Westchester County
Deputy County Executive John G. Tully representing County Executive Robert Bondi, Putnam County
County Executive Thomas Suozzi, Nassau County
Commissioner Janette Sadik-Khan, NYC Department of Transportation
Helena Williams Acting Executive Director and C.E.O., Metropolitan Transportation Authority
Robert Shinnick for County Executive Steve Levy, Suffolk County
Vincent Altieri for County Executive C. Scott Vanderhoef, Rockland County
Robert Zerrillo, Council Secretary

Advisory (Non-Voting) Principals/Representatives

Division Administrator Jeffrey Kolb, Federal Highway Administration
Regional Administrator Brigid Hynes-Cherin, Federal Transit Administration Executive Director
Executive Director Mary K. Murphy, North Jersey Transportation Planning Authority, Inc.
JoAnn Brennan McKee for George Pavlou, Acting Regional Administrator, US Environmental Protection Agency
Tom Schulze for Regional Administrator George Warrington, New Jersey Transit
Lou Venech for Chris O. Ward, Port Authority of New York and New Jersey
Michael Sheehan for Commissioner Alexander B. Grannis, NYS Department of Environmental Conservation

NYMTC Staff

Wieslawa Amber	Joel Ettinger	Howard J. Mann
Voncille Anderson	Oluseye Folarin	Larry McAuliffe
Jorge Argote	Leslie Fordjour	Andrea Miles-Cole
Sangeeta Bhowmick	Angelina Foster	Jaeki Min
Gerry Bogacz	Merrill Frank	Ali Mohseni
Kuo-Ann Chiao	Emma Gaitan	Larisa Morozovskaya
Thusitha Chandra	Maria Garcia	Siddharth Pandit
Rosemary Checca	Anthony Gawrych	Munnesh Patel
Michael Chiume	Adam Gullen	Mohammad Rashid
Kristen Cotton	Jean Gunsch	Abdus Salam
Lisa Daglian	Stephen Hausch	Jean Shanahan
Robert Donohue	Xia Jin	Sherry Southe
David Drits	Jan Khan	Alton Treadwell
Geroge Dua-Awareh	Kyeongsu Kim	Chad Wilcomb
Daniel Etkin	John Lopez	Fei Yang

OTHERS

Douglas Adam, Sam Schwartz	Corey B. Bearak, Harbor Experience Companies
Steven J. Alevy, Bankers Capital	Adam Benditsky, Hunter College
Manny Alvarado, HUD	Lawrence Berger, Nassau County
Mary D. Ameen, NJTPA	Seth Berman, NYCDOT
Lance Anderson, LIRR	Christine Berthet
Richard T. Anderson, New York Building Congress	Amit Bhowmick, PANYNJ
JoAnna Aniello, HUD	Jonathan Bien
Amy Apple, Hunter College	Linda Black, NYC Dept of Aging
Max Applebaum, Hunter College	Judy Bliss, NYCDOT
Michele Bager, NYSDOT	Murray Bodin, Concerned Grandparents
Linda Bailey, NYCDOT	Patricia Bourne, Nassau County

Chris Boylan, MTA
JJ Brandler, Bankers Capital
Robert Brickman, Nassau County
Joseph Brown, NYSDOT
Chris Brunson, Hunter College
Pam Buford, LIRR
Adam Burgh
James Burke, WEACT
Patricia Burkhardt, Friends of Edgewood Preserve
Andrew Camp, Hunter College
Skip Carrier, NYSDOT
Victor Carosi
Ellen Casesar-Quaye, NYSDOT
Luigi Casinelli, HDR One Company
Vishaan Chakraborti, Related Companies
Patricia Chemka, Westchester County
Alice Cheng, Cheng Solutions
Conor Clarke, Hunter College
Peter Cohen, AMTRAK
Jeremy Colangelo-Bryant, NJT
Ann Marie Corbalis, Arch St. Communication
Erin Cousins, Hunter College
Michael Crino, Michael Baker Engineering
Nancy Danzig, FTA
Joshua Delforia, Cambridge Systematics
Jamey Dempster, Cambridge Systematics
Robert A. Dennison, NYSDOT
Joan Dupont, NYSDOT
Ashley Emerole, Hunter College
Phil Eng, NYSDOT
Stacey Epifane, Nassau County
Roland Ericsson, Hatchmott, McDonald
Renee Espiau, Project for Public Space
Issa Faiza, NYCEDE
Felice Farber, GCZ of NY
Peter Ferol, Westchester County
Jon Fierman, Bankers Capital
Larry Filler, Transit Center
Leah Flax, The Louis Berger Group
Lawrence Fleischer, MTA
Tom Fox, Harbor Experience Companies
Anthony Gambilonghi, Middlesex Co. Planning
John Garcia
Neil Garry, Hunter College
Patrick Gerdin, Rockland County
Jeff Gerlach, Arch St. Communication
Ari Gershman
Paul Gessner, Gessner Transportation Consulting
Adam Goantz, Dept of Housing
Tatyana Golikova, NYSDOT
Elvin Goodman
Robert M. Gottheim, US Rep J. Nadlar Office

James Goveia, FTA
Michael Griffin, NYCDOT
Victoria Grimshaw, NYCDOH
William K. Guild, PCAC for MTA
George Haikalis, IRUM
Henry Hensley, Dept of Housing
Roger J. Herz, TIME
Paul Hess, Hunter College
Sandy Hornick, NYCDCP
Ernest Hutton
Jennifer M. Irven, Westchester County
Omar Ivarellos, Kasirer Consulting
Faiza Issa, NYCDEC
Raphael Issac
Omar Ivarellos, Kasirer Consulting
Joseph Jarran, NYCDOT
Jeric Jones, Hunter College
John Karras
Chris Kempner, Town of Riverhead
Ray Kenard, AWPIH
Onyinye Kujuo, NYCDOT
Jee Mee Kim, Sam Schwartz
Peter King, NYSDOT
Gregory Kisloff, HSH Associates
Barbara Klein, Transit Center
Naomi Klein, Westchester County
Andrew Kluger, Hunter College
Jay Kriegel, Related Companies
Ray LaHood, US Secretary of Transportation
Gary Landschoot, ARCADIS
Connie Lee, NYU
Jeffrey C. Lefrancios, Assemblyman Gothfired Off
Adam Levin, NYSDOT
Michael Levin, Town of North Hempstead
Bruce Lieberman, NY & Atlantic Railway
Thomas G. Lunke, Harlem Comm. Develop Corp
Thomas Madden, Town of Greenburgh
Uchenna Madu, NYSDOT
Phil Marino, Town of Stony Point
Ed Marrero, NYSDOH
John Mattera, NYC Parks & Rec.
Christy McDougall, Transit Center
Ramesh Mehta, HAKS
Michael Mifsud, Skanska
Kate Mikuliak, Councilmember Mendez Office
Bridget Moriarty, Hunter College
Anne Morris, Baruch College
Mary K. Murphy, NJTPA
Alicia Nolan, FHWA
Michael O'Connor, Town of Ossining
Bob Olmsted
Charles O'Shea, NYSDOT

Mark Owasykiw, Transit Center
Martha Panero, NYU
Arnold Park
Thaddeus Pawlowski, NYCDCP
Judith Peter, NYSDOT
Cameron Peterson
Renee Peter-Smith, NYCDOT
Elisa Picca, LIRR
John Pilner, Putnam County
Debra Pinkston, NYSDOH
Steve Pinkus, NYCDOT
Erin Puckertt, Hunter College
Jim Raleigh, Regional Rail Working Group
Laxmi Ramasubramian, Hunter College
Denise Ramirez, Nassau County
Ryan W. Rapp, Middlesex Co. Dept of Planning
Ophelia Ray-Fenner, NYCDOT
Naomi Resnek, MTA
Lucian Reynolds, Hunters College
Sarah Rios, MTA
Lilian Robertson, NYSDOT
Richard Roper, PANYNJ
Karen Rosenberger, FWHA
William Rothberg, Hunter College
Carol J. Ryan, Metropool
Irina Rybitskaia, NYSDOT
Charles Samul, DASNY
Yogesh Sanghvi, NYCDOT
Harris Schechtman, Sam Schwartz
Jack Schmidt, NYCDCP
Elana Schor, Streetsblog Capital Hill
Edward Sheeran, Town of Stony Point
Arkadiy Sherman, NYSDOT

Lixin Shi, Press
Anthony Shorris, NYU
Brien ten Siethoff, Cambridge Systematics
Frank Sinatra, HKLAW
Heather Sporn, NYSDOT
Samuel Stein, Hunter College
Robin Stout, Moynihan Station Development
James Stover, MTA
Adaryll Taylor, NYSDOT
Jai Therattil, NYCDOT
Gary Touryan, Transit & Rail Systems
Neal Trenk, Rockland County
Veronica Vanterpool, WEACT
Norman Vicient
Randy Wade, NYCDOT
Kimberly Wagner, Cambridge Systematics
Thomas Wakeman, Center for Maritime Systems
Roxanne Warren, Vision 42
Alexandros Washburn, NYCDCP
Robert Wechsler, Transport Workers Union
Robert Weisbrod
Raymond Werner, USEPA
William Wheeler, MTA
David Wipawsky, PANYNJ
Micahel Wojnar, Chambers
Melanie Zeman, USEPA

This September 24, 2009 Council Meeting synopsis was unanimously accepted by all members of the Council at its Annual Meeting held on March 18, 2010.

Respectfully Submitted,

*Andrea' Miles-Cole
Secretary 2
NYMTC*